2015–2016 Collection Management Committee Annual Project: Collaborative Collection Development

Executive Summary – June 2016

During 2015-2016, the Collection Management Committee (CMC) worked on project to assess CARLI member libraries interest in collaborating on collection development and to create a forum through which libraries could share information related to collection development and shared collections interests. The project involved a review of collaborative efforts made by other institutions, the development and administration of a survey, CARLI Collaborative Monograph Collection Interest Survey, to CARLI member libraries, analysis of the survey results and offering a webinar which presented some of the options available to member libraries. The Collection Management Committee undertook the development of a collaborative site for CARLI members related to collection management.

Google Groups for CARLI Collaborative Collection Development:
https://groups.google.com/forum/?hl=en#!forum/carli-collaborative-collections

Webinar Summary

On May 9, 2016, the CARLI Collection Management Committee presented the webinar: CARLI Print and Electronic Collaborative Collection Development Options for Monographs in AY17.

Presenters:

- Jeffry Archer, Head, Reference Instruction and Outreach, University of Chicago
- Deborah Blecic, Collections Coordinator, University of Illinois at Chicago
- Chris Diaz, Collections Management Librarian, National-Louis University

Deborah Blecic, Collections Coordinator, University of Illinois at Chicago started the webinar with a summary of the findings of the CMC survey: Fifty-two libraries responded to the survey. Of the respondents eleven indicated that they were very interested and had resources (both time and money) that they could devote to a collaborative project. The areas of high interest included Health Sciences and Business with ten of the respondents indicating their interest in the subject area, followed by Education with nine respondents expressing interest in a collaborative project. Literature (eight respondents), Physical Sciences (six respondents), Computer Science/Math, and Fine Arts (five respondents each), and Social Sciences and History (four respondents each) represented the subject areas of high interest.

Blecic then provided an overview of the webinar topics including:

1. Print collaborative collection development options
2. E-book collaborative collection development options
3. Sample discussion in one subject area – Education
4. Possible next steps in the process

Blecic then provided three options for print monograph collaboration. The first option could involve each library committing to purchase a certain amount of unique content in a specific subject area (i.e.: $4,000 in physics for FY17) if that content had not been purchased by another CARLI library by six months after the publication date. This option would require minimal communication with other libraries other than the original selection of a subject area and basic monitoring via I-Share and/or OCLC.

The second option presented a model for collaborative print purchasing. In this model libraries would divide up a subject area (i.e.: selecting an artist or a historical movement) and collect extensively in the area selected. A variation of this model would have libraries in one area gather resources from select presses (i.e.: Library One could purchase all books by University Press A on a certain subject while Library Two agrees to cover University Press B). Agreements could be fashioned in any manner that would suit the participants and would likely cover a fixed amount of time.

The third option referenced was Demand Driven Acquisitions (DDA) for print materials. This option would involve the collaboration of multiple libraries with a common book vendor agreeing to purchase based on patron or library demand. The model would be the same as any local DDA except this would be across multiple libraries. Interested libraries would need to confirm if any additional license agreement would be needed to work with a group. In this model, all of the libraries would load the initial records into their catalogs. After a library has purchased an item based on a patron request the other libraries in the collaborative agreement will remove the record from their local catalog listing.

This portion of the webinar concluded that these are not the only options for print collaboration, and any option developed by the membership is an alternative as well. Deborah Blecic reiterated the idea that any effort to make the CARLI statewide collection and/or the I-Share collection stronger is welcome.

Jeffry Archer, Head of Reference Instruction and Outreach at the University of Chicago Library, presented e-book options for collaboration. An overview of the past consortial e-book DDA collaborative program was presented which included the following information about the cooperative collections:

1. The project cost was $893,431 managed by CARLI
2. All CARLI members had access to the MARC records within their local OPAC (or had the option to load the records)
3. 3858 books were purchased
4. Each item was allowed to be loaned 35 times per year
5. The agreement was adjusted during the project based on use of collection
   a. Triggers for short term loans adjusted

A possible future collaborative pilot could include several options based on the learning experience of CARLI's previous agreement with EBL. The group would continue with EBL as there is a negotiated agreement. If members wished to purchase materials from additional publishers, CARLI could work with EBL to confirm if they would participate. The cost to participating libraries for each title is two and a half times the single user e-book price and could only be used thirty five times within a twelve month period. The titles would be available to all CARLI members whether they contribute to the new collection or not.

Archer posed a number questions to consider before developing or participating in a collaborative e-book collection.

1. What is the scope of the project?
2. What is the necessary level of participation before contributing institutions benefit?
3. Is DDA or Direct purchase the preferred model?
4. Who makes the selections and how is that determined?
5. What is the communication and coordination plan (i.e.: how are duplications avoided)?

The scope of the project is perhaps the most important aspect of the project. The collaboration must be beneficial to all the contributing participants. Subject areas, publishers, readership level etc. must be defined and agreed to by all participants. Equally important is the securing of financial commitments from all participants.

The financial considerations of an e-book collaboration include the cost of an e-book (2.5 times the list or single user e-book price), the point at which participants' access advantage outpaces their purchase price (the advantage starts with three participants in a pilot) and the increased purchase power of a large number of participants in a consortia effort. An example was provided illustrating the purchasing power of a leveraged buy to participants.

Direct purchases (DP) and DDA were compared

> DP (if approval based) requires active review
> DP allows for decisions at the title level based on individual selection
> DP requires coordination between CARLI and institutional selectors
> DP allows libraries to spend the exact amount desired
> DDA provides a wider range of titles for discovery
> DDA would more easily allow for a set budget number
> DDA allows for short term loans and may allow for purchase trigger adjustments
> DDA (as presently configured within CARLI) does not allow for limiting to certain local catalogs (patrons from all members would have access to select a DDA title)
> DDA requires use of CARLI resources to manage the process

A portion of the webinar showed how using GobiTween from YBP might facilitate collaboration among members to manage their selection process and share information with other CARLI members.

The next steps forward for a CARLI e-book collaborative project pilot as presented by Jeffry Archer for the Collection Management Committee include: self-identification of those institutions interested by subject area, a financial commitment by institutions interested in participating in a focused pilot, a resource (time and/or selector) commitment for working the pilot, and a continuing conversation and planning session (possibly a web meeting) for interested librarians/institutions.

The final presenter for the webinar was Chris Diaz, the Collections Management Librarian at National-Louis University. The presentation was entitled: Education.

This presentation started with an overview of a grant funded collaboration between nine Illinois libraries through the Illinois Cooperative Collection Management Program. The focus of the collection was "The Legacy of Brown versus Board of Education: Its Impact on Multicultural Education". The 2004 grant was $24,000 with participants receiving between $2500 and $4000 each. Each participating library selected subtopics with the entire project covering multiple subject areas within the multicultural education field including: administrative and legal issues, admissions, pedagogy and children's literature.

All participating libraries made purchased materials available for circulation via interlibrary loan and ILLINET. Each participating library agreed to catalog materials within six months of receipt at the institution and all participants agreed to communication guidelines including progress reports. The final reports and the collaborative collections were communicated via websites.

The webinar next covered the prospects for potential collaboration amongst Illinois libraries that offer undergraduate education programs. According to the websites of the National Council on Teacher Quality and CARLI, there are 40 colleges and universities in Illinois that participate in I-share and have undergraduate teacher preparation programs.

Potential education collaboration areas (based in part on the CMC Survey results) include:

Children's Literature	Higher Education
Teaching Kits	Common Core State Standards
K-12 Textbooks	Fine Arts Education
Education Policy	Early Childhood Education
Diversity in Education	Special Education

Chris Diaz then presented the Google Groups collaborative site and provided an overview of how collaborating on the site could work.

The webinar concluded with a discussion of the topics discussed facilitated by Jeffry Archer. Further information on coordination will be provided via the CARLI email list and on the Collection Management Committee discussion board: https://groups.google.com/forum/#!forum/carli-collaborative-collections

The results of the CMC Survey were shared with the survey participants (including a list of the participants and their collection interest areas). The survey summary was shared with participants on the webinar and is included in this project summary. And, a link to the webinar (and the individual presentations) was shared on the Collections Management portion of the CARLI website.

The Collection Management Committee plans to encourage participation by continuing to facilitate collaborative efforts including sending a follow-up e-mail to encourage participation in future conversations about collaborative efforts via participation in the Google Groups site (listed above).

CARLI Collaborative Collection Development: Results from a Survey
April 2016

Summary

The Collection Management Committee surveyed CARLI member institutions to explore the interest in collaborative collection development of monographs. The survey generated 89 responses from 52 CARLI member institutions.

Thirteen member libraries indicated previous involvement with collaborative collection development. The examples provided include agreements between institutions to collect music scores of contemporary composers, the publishing output of specific countries (such as Japan and Brazil), religious studies materials, and consortial eBook purchasing. The groups involved in these collaborative projects include Ivies Plus, the University of Illinois system, area studies librarians, the Association of Chicago Theological Schools, and CARLI.

Respondents indicated that lack of money and lack of time are likely to be the two biggest challenges for any collaborative collection development project within CARLI. The majority of respondents indicated significant budgetary constraints, and several respondents indicated key staffing limitations. Other potential barriers include technological constraints and the willingness of vendors to participate.

With regard to subject areas, the results show the highest interest in and viability for pilot projects in the subject areas of Health Sciences, Education, and Business.

CARLI members that are either "Very Interested" or "Extremely Interested" collaborative collection development and are able to commit both time and money (11):

- Benedictine University
- Blackburn College
- Catholic Theological Union
- Dominican University
- Illinois College of Optometry
- Illinois State University
- Loyola University Chicago
- National-Louis University
- Quincy University
- Trinity Christian College
- University of Illinois at Chicago

Subjects for Collaborative Collection Development	Subjects of Local Priority

Green refers to institutions **with both time and money** for collaborative collection development.
Blue refers to institutions **with time but no money** for collaborative collection development.
Red refers to institutions **with money but no time** for collaborative collection development.
Black refers to institutions that are either **not sure or cannot** contribute.

Health Sciences (10)
- College of DuPage (print)
- Illinois College of Optometry (eBooks)
- Eastern Illinois University (eBooks)
- Trinity Christian College (either)
- Quincy College (eBooks)
- Dominican University (either)
- University of St. Francis (either)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (either)
- Governors State University (print)
- Rush University (either)

Business (10)
- College of DuPage (print)
- Benedictine University (either)
- Eastern Illinois University (eBooks)
- Blackburn College (either)
- University of St. Francis (either)
- Joliet Junior College (either)
- University of Chicago (eBooks)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)
- Trinity International University (either)
- Spertus Institute of Jewish Studies (eBooks)

Education (9)
- Benedictine University (either)
- University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (either)
- Eastern Illinois University (eBooks)
- Trinity Christian College (Print)
- National Louis University (eBook)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Dominican University (either)
- University of St. Francis (either)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (either)

Health Sciences (15)
- Illinois College of Optometry (eBooks)
- DePaul University (eBooks)
- Quincy College (eBooks)
- Dominican University (either)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- South Suburban College (print)
- University of St. Francis (print)
- Triton College (print)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (either)
- Elmhurst College (eBooks)
- Joliet Junior College (either)
- University of Chicago (eBooks)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)
- Governors State University (either)
- Rush University (either)

Computer Science and Mathematics (8)
- University of Chicago (eBooks)
- Knox College (eBooks)
- DePaul University (eBooks)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)
- South Suburban College (print)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (either)
- University of St. Francis (either)

Physical Sciences (8)
- Blackburn College (either)
- Quincy College (eBooks)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)
- Triton College (print)
- Joliet Junior College (either)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)

Literature (8)
- Trinity Christian College (Print)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Blackburn College (either)
- Triton College (print)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (either)
- Roosevelt University (either)
- Joliet Junior College (either)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)

Physical Sciences (6)
- Eastern Illinois University (eBook)
- Quincy College (eBook)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)
- University of St. Francis (either)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)

Computer Science and Mathematics (5)
- University of Chicago (eBooks)
- Knox College (either)
- Quincy College (eBooks)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)

Fine Arts (5)
- Knox College (either)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (either)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (either)

International Studies / Social Science (4)
- College of DuPage (print)
- Eastern Illinois University (eBooks)
- Blackburn College (either)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (Print)

History (4)
- Trinity Christian College (Print)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (either)

General Education / Test Prep (4)
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)
- Joliet Junior College (eBook)
- Loyola University Chicago (eBook)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)

Religion (7)
- Benedictine University (either)
- Trinity Christian College (either)
- Catholic Theological Union (either)
- JKM Library Trust (eBooks)
- University of St. Francis (print)
- Trinity International University (either)
- Spertus Institute of Jewish Studies (either)

International Studies / Social Sciences (6)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (either)
- Dominican University (either)
- University of Illinois at Chicago (print)
- University of Chicago (either)
- University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (eBooks)
- Trinity Christian College (either)

History (6)
- College of DuPage (print)
- Knox College (either formats)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Blackburn College (either)
- South Suburban College (print)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (either)

Education (5)
- University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (either)
- Trinity Christian College (Print)
- National Louis University (either)
- University of St. Francis (print)
- Rend Lake College (either)

Fine Arts (5)
- Trinity Christian College (Print)
- Knox College (either)
- Lake Forest College (either)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (print)
- Elmhurst (print)

Literature (4)
- University of St. Francis (print / YA lit)
- Triton College (Print/ YA lit)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (eBooks / plays)
- Joliet Junior College (either)

Criminal Justice (3)
- Quincy College (eBooks)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (either)
- Trinity International University (either)

Psychology (2)
- Trinity Christian College (Print)
- National Louis University (eBooks)

Religion (3)
- Catholic Theological Union (either)
- JKM Library Trust (either)
- Spertus Institute of Jewish Studies (eBook)

Foreign Language (1)
- Quincy College (eBooks)

Other (1)
- The University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign is interested in collaboratively collecting scholarly books from University Presses in print and/or electronic formats

Business (6)
- Benedictine University (either)
- South Suburban College (Print)
- Elmhurst (eBooks / marketing)
- Joliet Junior College (either)
- University of Chicago (eBook)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)

General Education / Test Prep (5)
- Western Illinois University
- Illinois Math and Science Academy (either)
- Triton College (print)
- Joliet Junior College (either)
- Illinois Valley Community College (either)

Criminal Justice / Law (4)
- DePaul University (either)
- Quincy College (eBooks)
- University of Chicago (either)
- Southern Illinois at Edwardsville (eBooks)

Humanities (2)
- Illinois Institute of Technology (either)
- Loyola University Chicago (eBooks)

Psychology (3)
- Trinity Christian College (print)
- National Louis University (either)
- University of Chicago (either)

Comments from the survey:

In support of this kind of project:

- **"**Having participated in collaborative monograph collections projects in the past, I really miss the networking opportunities with other I-Share colleagues in related areas. Even if the collaborative projects aren't possible in the current budget situation, trying to bring together subject librarians would be useful!"
- **"**We'd just be interested in learning more - this sounds like it has potential!"
- **"**I love that CARLI is looking at collaborative collection development, especially given our fiscally challenged times."
- **"**This is a useful survey, and I hope the information will be shared."

Demand-driven acquisitions:

- "I'm primarily interested in the kind of patron-driven ebook purchasing that was funded recently by CARLI. That project resulted in the first ebooks that our students have ever really wanted to use!"
- "We would only be interested in PDA collaborations."
- "Perhaps an extension of CARLI's print demand driven model for specific subject areas. We would certainly be interested in collaborative collection development for ebooks since those purchased independently by CARLI member libraries are unavailable to patrons at other institutions."
- "I would love to see another patron-driven ebook acquisition program like the one sponsored by CARLI a year ago. That provided additional books that all consortial libraries could access. That offers hope at a time when materials budgets are slim to none across the state."

Interest in Other forms of CARLI member collaboration:

- "I would be more interested in different types of shared collection development and/or management. Thoughts include a "last copy" project for media; digital preservation; supporting open access monographs such as Knowledge Unlatched."

Comments from the survey: (cont.)

Realities to consider:

- "We are always interested in CARLI collaboration, but the current budgetary climate may hamper our ability to participate."
- "We would have to evaluate cost-benefit very carefully."
- "Faculty members' research interests overlap. We end up having to purchase our own copies. The idea of sharing collections is not always welcomed by faculty members"
- "We are part of CARLI, but not I-Share, so maintaining access through the catalog could be challenging. It also represents a cultural shift and loss of control over the long-term preservation of the content (e.g., if another library is holding print content, what happens when they want to withdraw it?). We are spread thin with other projects, and may not have time to contribute to another one."
- "I think it really depends on the intent and details of the collaboration. In some cases (like the five priorities mentioned above), we might want to collaborate if the point would be for us to have expanded access to subject content, whereas for other areas it might be so that we could potentially commit to spending less but maintaining similar access."